# Topicality Index

[Topicality Index 1](#_Toc297067423)

[\*\*\*\*\*NEG Topicality Violations\*\*\*\*\* 2](#_Toc297067424)

[\*\*\*T—Space is a Void—No Asteroids, Planets, Etc (Shell)\*\*\* 3](#_Toc297067425)

[T—space is a void Extensions 4](#_Toc297067426)

[\*\*\*T—Beyond Means Must Launch Beyond the Mesosphere (Shell)\*\*\* 5](#_Toc297067427)

[Beyond Means Further Than (Extensions) 6](#_Toc297067428)

[\*\*\*T—Privates Aren’t Topical (Shell)\*\*\* 7](#_Toc297067429)

[Privates Aren’t Topical Extensions 8](#_Toc297067430)

[\*\*\*T—Joint Cooperation Isn’t Topical (Shell)\*\*\* 9](#_Toc297067431)

[\*\*\*T—Can’t Explore Earth (Shell)\*\*\* 10](#_Toc297067432)

[\*\*\*T—Develop Doesn’t Mean Use (Shell)\*\*\* 11](#_Toc297067433)

[\*\*\*T—Space Means Outer Space (Shell)\*\*\* 12](#_Toc297067434)

[Space is Outer Space (Extensions) 13](#_Toc297067435)

[\*\*\*T—Increase Doesn’t Mean Create (Shell)\*\*\* 14](#_Toc297067436)

[\*\*\*T—Increase Means Net Increase (Shell)\*\*\* 15](#_Toc297067437)

[Increase Means a Net Increase 16](#_Toc297067438)

[\*\*\*T—Substantially Means 30% (must be greater than $5.5 billion)—Shell\*\*\* 17](#_Toc297067439)

[Substantially Extensions: Must Give Substantially Meaning 18](#_Toc297067440)

[\*\*\*T—Substantially Means Without Material Qualification (Shell)\*\*\* 19](#_Toc297067441)

[\*\*\*T—Beyond is Physical, Not Spiritual (Shell)\*\*\* 20](#_Toc297067442)

[Overview: Topic is Huge: Must Limit It 21](#_Toc297067443)

[AT: Our interpretation is Reasonable 22](#_Toc297067444)

[T Isn’t a Reverse Voting Issue 23](#_Toc297067445)

[Answers to the Kritik of Topicality 24](#_Toc297067446)

[Answers to the Kritik of Topicality 25](#_Toc297067447)

[Answers to the Kritik of Topicality 26](#_Toc297067448)

[\*\*\*\*\*AFF Answers\*\*\*\*\* 27](#_Toc297067449)

[Space Includes Asteroids (2ac) 28](#_Toc297067450)

[Space Includes Asteroids (Extensions) 29](#_Toc297067451)

[Exploration 2ac Answers 30](#_Toc297067452)

[Exploration Means Investigation 31](#_Toc297067453)

[Mining AFF: Development 32](#_Toc297067454)

[Beyond 2ac Front-Line 33](#_Toc297067455)

[Increase Can Mean Create 34](#_Toc297067456)

[Increase 2ac Front-Line 35](#_Toc297067457)

[Earth Means the Third Planet From the Sun 36](#_Toc297067458)

[Mesosphere Means the Region Beyond the Stratosphere 37](#_Toc297067459)

[And/or Means Either (2ac Front Line) 38](#_Toc297067460)

[Substantially Counter-interpretations 39](#_Toc297067461)

# \*\*\*\*\*NEG Topicality Violations\*\*\*\*\*

# \*\*\*T—Space is a Void—No Asteroids, Planets, Etc (Shell)\*\*\*

## A) Negative Interpretation: Space is the void beyond Earth’s atmosphere.

E. Julius Dasch, 2005 (Editor), A DICTIONARY OF SPACE EXPLORATION, 2005, 307.

Space: The void that exists beyond Earth's atmosphere.

## B) Violation: the plan deals with asteroids, not the void which is space.

## C) Standards:

## 1) Limits: they allow for dozens of cases dealing with asteroids, the Moon, Mars, etc. exploding the topic.

## 2) Precision: they explore objects in space, not space itself.

## D) Voting issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# T—space is a void Extensions

## Space is the volume in which celestial bodies move, not the bodies themselves:

Sybil P. Parker, 1994 (Editor), MCGRAW-HILL DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 1994, 178.

Space: More generally, the volume in which all celestial bodies, including the earth, move.

## Space is the vacuum which exists beyond the atmosphere of all bodies in the Universe:

FACTS ON FILE DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 2006, 443.

Space: The near-vacuum existing beyond the atmospheres of all bodies in the Universe.

## Space is the region between planets and stars:

Simon Mitton, 2007 (Prof., Astronomy, Cambridge U.), CAMBRIDGE ILLUSTRATED DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 2007, 317. Space: The regions between the planets and stars, excluding their immediate atmospheres.

## Space is the region between the celestial bodies of the universe:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online, Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/space)

7. a. the region beyond the earth's atmosphere occurring between the celestial bodies of the universe. The density is normally negligible although cosmic rays, meteorites, gas clouds, etc, can occur. It can be divided into cislunar space (between the earth and moon), interplanetary space , interstellar space , and intergalactic space b. ( as modifier ): a space station ; a space simulator

## Space is the expanse in which the material objects are located:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online, Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/space)

1. the unlimited three-dimensional expanse in which all material objects are located Related: spatial

# \*\*\*T—Beyond Means Must Launch Beyond the Mesosphere (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation:

## 1. Beyond means reaching further than.

Augustus Stevenson, 2010 (Editor), NEW OXFORD AMERICAN DICTIONARY, 3rd Ed., 2010, 161.

Beyond: Further reaching than.

## 2. The mesosphere is the region beyond the stratosphere.

Joseph Angelo, Jr., 2006 (Editor), ENCYCLOPEDIA OF SPACE AND ASTRONOMY, 2006, 393.

Mesosphere: The region of Earth's atmosphere above the stratosphere that is characterized by temperature decreasing with height. The top of this layer, called the menopause, occurs between 80 and 85 kilometers altitude.

## B. Violation: They explore from Earth—not beyond the mesosphere.

## C. Standards:

## 1) Fair Limits: They explode the topic to any ground based instrument—they should be limited to launching exploration vehicles into space.

## 2) Key to disad and counterplan ground: They avoid all disads based off of launches like ozone and space junk, and ground based exploration should be neg counterplan ground.

## 3) They’re extra-topical—their ground-based instruments could be used to explore below the mesosphere:

## a) Extra-T proves the resolution alone is insufficient—warranting negation of the resolution.

## b) Shouldn’t have to run and win an argument to get them back to ground zero—creates a time and strategy skew for the NEG making it a voting issue.

## D) Voting issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# Beyond Means Further Than (Extensions)

## Beyond means above:

Augustus Stevenson, 2010 (Editor), NEW OXFORD AMERICAN DICTIONARY, 3rd Ed., 2010, 161.

Beyond: Above or greater than.

## Beyond means to the farther side of:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online. Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/beyond)

on, at, or to the farther side of: Beyond those trees you'll find his house.

## Beyond means more distant than:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online. Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/beyond)

2.farther on than; more distant than: beyond the horizon; beyond the sea.

## Beyond means over and above:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online. Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/beyond)

5.more than; in excess of; over and above: to stay beyond one's welcome.

# \*\*\*T—Privates Aren’t Topical (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation.

## 1. “Its” is possessive referring to exploration and/or development by the federal government

Carol-June Cassidy, 2008 (Managing Editor), CAMBRIDGE DICTIONARY OF AMERICAN ENGLISH, 2nd Ed., 2008, 464. Its: Belonging to or connected with the thing or animal mentioned; the possessive form of it.

## 2. Private industry is distinct from the United States federal government.

Eban Goodstein, 2008 (Prof., Economics, Lewis & Clark College), ECONOMICS AND THE ENVIRONMENT, 2008, 399. Photovoltaic power is so attractive that, in the long run, it is likely to be developed by private industry regardless of U.S. government policy. The question really is when and by whom?

## B. Violation: Plan uses private industries.

## C. Standards:

## 1) Fair limits: they allow thousands of commercial entities to be topical.

## 2) Key to disad and counterplan ground: They avoid USFG disads and take away the privates counterplan.

## 3) Precision: Our evidence draws a distinction between private industries and the federal government.

## D) Voting Issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# Privates Aren’t Topical Extensions

## Private industry is distinct from NASA.

Gene Myers, 2009 (CEO, The Space Island Group), SPACE-BASED SOLAR POWER SATELLITES, 2009, 10.

Why Isn't NASA Building These Stations and Solar Sets? NASA isn't permitted to operate commercial businesses in space, but they will help us with technical or engineering issues. The shuttle program is scheduled to end next year, so the aerospace companies that build the shuttle's engines, fuel tanks and other components are eager to work with us.

# \*\*\*T—Joint Cooperation Isn’t Topical (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation.

## Its means belonging to.

Stuart Flexner, 1987 (Editor-in-chief), RANDOM HOUSE DICTIONARY OF THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE, UNABRIDGED, 2nd Ed., 1987, 1017.

Its: The possessive form of it.

## B. Violation: Plan does a joint project with another country.

## C. Standards:

1) Fair limits: Multiple agencies and other nations have space programs, exploding the topic:

Michael Dwyer, 2008 (Staff), THE AGE, Jan. 31, 2008, 21.

In November, The Guardian reported that commercial entities in the US, Europe and Japan are competing to launch the first solar receptor satellite tower, a giant energy collector that could, according to the Pentagon's National Space Security Office, satisfy 10% of the US's power needs by 2050 ([www.tinyurl.com/2lq8gx](http://www.tinyurl.com/2lq8gx)). "Space-based solar power offers a way to break the tyranny of these day-night, summer-winter and weather cycles and provide continuous and predictable power to any location on Earth," the Pentagon report says.

## 2) Key to disad and counterplan ground: They destroy links based on angering other countries because they can include them, they also destroy international counterplans for the same reason.

## 3) Bright Line: The negative draws a clear line between unilateral and multi-lateral cases—preserving precision on the topic.

## D) Voting Issue: For Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# \*\*\*T—Can’t Explore Earth (Shell)\*\*\*

## A) Negative Interpretation: Space exploration is distinct from exploration of the Earth.

Kim Evans, 2009 (Journalist), SPACE EXPLORATION: TRIUMPHS AND TRAGEDIES, 2009, 103.

Only a handful of robotic spacecraft are sent to other planets. The vast majority of them circle Earth or the Sun. Spacecraft in Earth orbit serve commercial, military, and scientific purposes. Scientists rely on satellites to collect data about Earth's weather, climate, atmospheric conditions, sea levels, ocean circulation, and gravitational and electromagnetic fields. These satellites are not space explorers but Earth observers that reside in space.

## B) Violation: The affirmative uses spacecraft to explore Earth and not space, however, the two ideas are distinct.

Raja Menon, 2009 (Chair, Task Force on National Assessment, National Security Council), SPACE SECURITY AND GLOBAL COOPERATION, 2009, 75-76.

If satellites are the greatest use that humankind has got out of space, then it is relevant to note that 760 satellites out of 800 look at the earth, while the remaining 40 look outwards at outer space. So, in the most useful segment of space use, man is most concerned, not with inter-stellar discovery or travel but with gaining an advantage, competitively on earth.

## C) Standards:

## 1) Limits: literally thousands of AFF’s become topical if they can explore earth for climate change, resources, natural disasters, etc.

## 2) Division of ground: should be limited to cases that explore or develop space.

## 3) Precision: exploring space is distinct from exploring Earth.

## D) Voting Issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# \*\*\*T—Develop Doesn’t Mean Use (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation.

## Development means to construct or convert improving resources in space.

Christine Lindberg, 2007 (Editor), OXFORD COLLEGE DICTIONARY, 2nd Ed., 2007, 380.

Develop: Construct or convert so as to improve existing resources.

## B. Violation: they use space, they don’t develop it.

## C. Standards:

## 1. Fair limits: they allow for the launching of any craft into space, opening the door to any satellite or even launching garbage into space that doesn’t develop space.

## 2. Precision: the topic calls for exploration or development, not mere use, of space.

## 3. Bright Line: they blur the term development with use.

## D. Voting Issue: for Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# \*\*\*T—Space Means Outer Space (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation.

## Space is the part of the universe lying outside Earth’s atmosphere.

Joseph Angelo, 2006 Jr., (Editor), ENCYCLOPEDIA OF SPACE AND ASTRONOMY, 2006, 554.

Space: Specifically, the part of the universe lying outside the limits of Earth's atmosphere. By informal international agreement, outer space is usually considered to begin at between 100 and 200 kilometers altitude.

## B. Violation: they don’t explore or develop outer space.

## C. Standards:

## 1) Fair ground: They avoid core negative ground by not exploring or developing outer space.

## 2) Field Context: Angelo evidence is from the Encyclopedia of Space and Astronomy.

## D) Voting Issue: For Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# Space is Outer Space (Extensions)

## Space is outer space:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online, Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/space)

6. a. the region beyond the earth's atmosphere containing the other planets of the solar system, stars, galaxies, etc; universe b. ( as modifier ): a space probe ; space navigation

## Space is outer space:

Joseph Angelo, 2006 Jr., (Editor), ENCYCLOPEDIA OF SPACE AND ASTRONOMY, 2006, 554.

Space: Specifically, the part of the universe lying outside the limits of Earth's atmosphere. By informal international agreement, outer space is usually considered to begin at between 100 and 200 kilometers altitude.

## Space means outer space:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online, Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/space)

23. of, pertaining to, or concerned with outer space or deep space: a space mission.

## Space refers to the part of the universe above the Earth, not just any space:

Sybil P. Parker, 1994 (Editor), MCGRAW-HILL DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 1994, 178.

Space: Specifically, the part of the universe lying outside the limits of the earth's atmosphere.

# \*\*\*T—Increase Doesn’t Mean Create (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation. “Increase” is distinct from “create”.

WORDS AND PHRASES, 1960, 381. “Increased,” as used in West’s Ann.Cal. Const. art. 12, § 11, providing that the stock and bonded indebtedness of corporations shall not be increased without the consent of the person holding the larger amount of the stock, does not include or apply to the first creation of bonded indebtedness. To give it such meaning would be to inject into the provision the word “create.”

## B. Violation. The plan creates a new program, it doesn’t increase an existing one.

## C. Standards:

## 1) Fair Limits: Their interpretation allows them to create any exploration or development policy for any purpose—they should instead be required to defend existing policies and merely alter the size of them.

## 2) Precision: Increase is fundamentally different than create—making our interpretation more precise.

## D) Voting Issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# \*\*\*T—Increase Means Net Increase (Shell)\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation: Increase is a net increase—not a trade-off with existing programs.

WORDS AND PHRASES, 2007 CUMULATIVE SUPPLEMENTARY PAMPHLET, Vol. 20A, 07, 309.

Increase: Term “increase” as used in statute giving the Energy Commission modification jurisdiction over any alteration, replacement, or improvement of equipment that results in “increase” of 50 megawatts or more in electric generating capacity of existing thermal power plant, refers to “net increase” in power plant’s total generating capacity in deciding whether there has been the requisite 50-megawatt increase as a result of new units being incorporated into the plant. Department of Water & Power v. Energy Resources Conservation & Development Com., 3 Cal.Rptr.2d 289, 2 Cal.App.4th 206.

## B. Violation: the plan is a trade-off: not a net increase.

## C. Standards:

## 1. Fair ground: they eliminate politics and spending disad links by allowing no increase in NASA’s budget.

## 2. Bright line: our interpretation allows only for cases that provide a net increase in NASA’s budget.

## D. Voting issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# Increase Means a Net Increase

## Increase means a net increase:

WORDS AND PHRASES, 2007 CUMULATIVE SUPPLEMENTARY PAMPHLET, Vol. 20A, 07, 76.

Increase: Within insurance company’s superintendent’sj employment contract, “increase” meant net increase in premiums generated by agent calculated by subtracting “lapses” or premiums lost on policies previously issued. Lanier v. Trans-World Life Ins. Co., 258 So.2d 103.

# \*\*\*T—Substantially Means 30% (must be greater than $5.5 billion)—Shell\*\*\*

## A. Negative Interpretation.

1. In the context of science policy, “Substantially” means at least thirty percent.

Dan Kammen, 2010 (founding director, Renewable and Appropriate Energy Laboratory), 2010 (“President Obama's Science Spending.” February 5, 2010. Online. Accessed May 8, 2011 at http://www.wbur.org/npr/123410020/president-obamas-science-spending)

Prof. KAMMEN: Well, I think that in my particular area, everyone is kind of focused on their own, is that solar gets a pretty substantial increase, about a 30 percent increase right now. I am most concerned on both opening of new frontiers and really competing on the global stage, that there is a suite of renewables: solar, wind, energy storage. These are critical areas, and I like the increases Ive seen. I also like the fact that a number of these got profiled in the ARPA budget.

2. Substantially must be measured in comparison to the entirety of the surrounding circumstances.

Words & Phrases, 1967, 759.

“‘Substantial’ is a relative term, the meaning of which is to be gauged by all the circumstances surrounding the transaction, in reference to which the expression has been used. It imports a considerable amount or value in opposition to that which is inconsequential or small.”

## B. Violation. NASA’s budget is $18.5 billion—the plan must be greater than $5.5 billion.

Clara Moskowitz (staff writer), 2011 (April 15, 2011. “NASA's 2011 Budget Should Allow Flexibility Despite Cuts.” Online. Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://www.space.com/11411-nasa-2011-budget-cuts-constellation-funding.html)

A new federal spending bill represents a cut to NASA's funding, but a lessening of restrictions on how the agency spends that money for the rest of this year.The new measure is a political compromise between democrats and republicans, and includes significant spending cuts in the 2011 federal budget. NASA will have to make do with about $18.5 billion, putting its budget roughly $240 million below last year's funding level. NASA and the rest of the federal government had been in limbo while lawmakers haggled over the budget. But on Thursday (April 14), Congress passed a spending measure called a continuing resolution that will cover the last five months of the year 2011.

## C. Standards:

## 1) Fair limits: they allow cases with tiny funding increases to be topical.

## 2) Ground: Can’t win spending or politics links off of tiny increases.

## D) Topicality is a voting issue:

## Fairness, Education, and Ground

# Substantially Extensions: Must Give Substantially Meaning

## Even if the negative interpretation is somewhat arbitrary, the affirmative interpretation risks writing the term substantially out of the topic completely. However, “substantially” must have meaning in the resolution:

Corpus Juris Secundum, 83, 765. *“Substantially.* A relative and elastic term which should be interpreted in accordance with the context in which it is used. While it must be employed with care and discrimination, it must, nevertheless, be given effect.”

# \*\*\*T—Substantially Means Without Material Qualification (Shell)\*\*\*

## A) Negative Interpretation: Substantially means without qualification.

DON BLEWETT, 1976 (Chairperson California Unemployment Insurance Appeals Board, Young v. Laura Scudder’s Pet, Inc. January 29, 1976. www.cuiab.ca.gov/precedent/pb181.doc.)

"Substantially. Essentially; without material qualification; in the main; in substance; materially; in a substantial manner. Kirkpatrick v. Journal Pub. Co., 210 Ala. 10, 97 So. 58, 59; Gibson v. Glos, 271 I11. 368, I11 N.E. 123, 124; McEwen v. New York Life Ins. Co., 23 Cal. App. 694, 139 P. 242, 243. About, actually, competently, and essentially. Gilmore v. Red Top Cab Co. of Washington, 171 Wash. 346, 17 P. 2d 886, 887."

## B) Violation: the plan puts a condition on their increase in space exploration.

## C) Standards:

## 1) Bright line: percentage based definitions are arbitrary—only our interpretation provides a clear line of what substantially means.

## 2) Fair ground: Requiring unconditional action by the AFF grants disad ground from other countries and counterplan ground to condition the increases.

## D) Voting Issue:

## Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# \*\*\*T—Beyond is Physical, Not Spiritual (Shell)\*\*\*

## A) Negative Interpretation:

## Beyond means outside the physical limits of

Augustus Stevenson, 2010 (Editor), NEW OXFORD AMERICAN DICTIONARY, 3rd Ed., 2010, 161.

Beyond: Outside the physical limits or range of.

## B) Violation: Plan deals with a metaphysical, not physical, meaning of beyond.

## C) Standards:

## 1) Fair limits: potentially limitless philosophical or metaphysical worldviews exist for going beyond the Earth’s mesosphere.

## 2) Bright Line: Our interpretation establishes a clear bright line of what is topical.

## D) Voting Issue: Fairness, Education, and Ground.

# Overview: Topic is Huge: Must Limit It

## This topic is huge—you need to find a way to vote for a way to make it manageable:

A) Development and exploration are both potentially huge terms—it’s almost impossible to determine how they are distinct from use with a broad interpretation—it means launching something into space for any conceivable purpose—to map asteroids, to spot solar flares, to explore Mars, to colonize space, etc. all become topical.

## B) Advantage ground is massive—people have the potential to claim advantages both on Earth and from space on this topic—you need to protect the negative and find a way to limit the topic.

## C) Overlimiting is better than underlimiting:

A) Overlimiting allows for more case specific strategies—prevents a devolution to generics and allows the negative to keep the focus on space policy.

B) Depth is better than breadth—we get more in-depth education and can focus on the specifics.

C) Helps small schools—smaller topics allow smaller schools to keep up and not be crushed by research machine schools.

# AT: Our interpretation is Reasonable

## 1) Reasonability is arbitrary: Can’t determine what is reasonable and what isn’t reasonable.

## 2) Counter-interpretation: You should prefer competing interpretations of the resolution and not just default to what you think is reasonable.

## 3) Competing interpretation stops judge intervention: allows the debate to be decided by the debaters.

## 4) Best interpretation prevents a race to the bottom: if the affirmative can prove they have the superior interpretation, then the negative can’t just win with a bad interpretation of the resolution.

# T Isn’t a Reverse Voting Issue

1. TOPICALITY IS A BURDEN FOR THE AFFIRMATIVE NOT THE NEGATIVE.

The burden of the affirmative is to prove the resolution true, to “affirm” the resolution. Merely because the affirmative proves their plan falls under the resolution does not prove the resolution is justified. The resolution must still be proven to be advantageous. Merely meeting one level of a two-part test does not mean the affirmative should win the debate.

2. A “GOOD FAITH” TOPICALITY VIOLATION SHOULD NOT COST THE NEGATIVE THE ENTIRE DEBATE.

Merely because we honestly believed there was a legitimate Topicality concern with the affirmative plan and are now convinced that such is not the case should not cost us the entire debate. For example, if we ran two disadvantages and discovered later that one did not link to the affirmative plan, the judge should not disregard the other disadvantage merely because we chose to concede that the first did not link to the case.

3. TOPICALITY IS NOT A “TIME SUCK.”

If the affirmative truly thought this topicality violation was designed to get them to spend too much time on the argument, then the appropriate response is to run three or four of their best answers and move on to other issues in the debate. Merely because the affirmative chose to make multiple topicality answers is not a reason to vote against the negative team.

4. THE NEGATIVE TEAM SHOULD NOT BE REQUIRED TO EXTEND EVERY ARGUMENT.

The essence of quality debate is the ability to pick and choose the best possible arguments and extend only those in the last rebuttal. Our admission that this is not the best argument we have in the debate only enhances the quality of the debate.

5. NO INTELLECTUAL PURPOSE IS SERVED BY MAKING TOPICALITY A VOTING ISSUE AGAINST THE NEGATIVE TEAM.

The purpose of Topicality is to provide a check on the scope of the discussion initiated by the affirmative. No such purpose is served by punishing the negative for running a Topicality violation.

# Answers to the Kritik of Topicality

1. TOPICALITY ESTABLISHES THE FRAMEWORK FOR THE ENTIRE ROUND.

Either side’s ability to make any kind of argument, including critical arguments, stems from the necessity for the affirmative plan to be topical.

2. TOPICALITY IS A CENTRAL AFFIRMATIVE BURDEN.

Merely because the critical performance of the affirmative is beneficial in some sense does not obviate the affirmative of the burden to “affirm” the resolution.

3. ALLOWING CRITICAL ARGUMENTS TO SUPERSEDE TOPICALITY ADVERSELY AFFECTS NEGATIVE GROUND.

By lifting the affirmative burden to uphold the resolution, the affirmative can merely pick to critique any aspect or element of society, regardless of what the topic wording said.

4. ALLOWING CRITICAL ARGUMENTS TO SUPERSEDE TOPICALITY HINDERS THE NEGATIVE’S ABILITY TO ANSWER THE AFFIRMATIVE’S CRITICISM.

By allowing the affirmative to critique whatever they wish, the judge gets a false sense of the validity of the affirmative critique. Because the negative is ill-prepared to answer critiques on issues other than the topic, the judge may falsely buy into the affirmative criticism without adequate understanding of the arguments against such a critique.

5. TOPICALITY IS AN “A PRIORI” ISSUE.

Topicality happens “above the board,” meaning it is an argument that takes place prior to when the “debate game” begins. Entering a critical argument into the debate game may be beneficial, but the affirmative must first meet certain burdens before the game begins.

6. ACCEPTING THEIR STANDARD LEADS TO “HOLLOW” CRITICISMS.

The affirmative would be allowed to critique society at the most basic level with which the negative could never disagree. Critiques arguing that racism or sexism is bad are obvious comments that no one would disagree with. To deal with complex issues like those posed by the resolution, the affirmative team should be required to present a topical course of action.

# Answers to the Kritik of Topicality

7. ARGUMENTATION REQUIRES A “DIALECTIC” OR FAIR ABILITY FOR THE NEGATIVE TO CREATE AN “ANTITHESIS” TO THE AFFIRMATIVE “THESIS.” FAILURE TO MAINTAIN THIS RECIPROCAL OBLIGATION LEADS TO VIOLENCE, STRIFE, AND THE SEPARATION OF PERSON FROM PERSON AND NATION FROM NATION.

Douglas Ehninger, 1970 prof. of speech communication at the University of Iowa, 1970, (Speech Monographs, vol. 37; 110). But this process also is reflexive, for insofar as we treat the “other” as a person rather than as an “object,” we become persons ourselves; while insofar as we fail do so, our own “personhood” is to that extent diminished. The attributes of freedom and responsibility that are defining of the “person” are not absolutes with respect to the “other,” but are states that are only reached in “relationship.” Relation, inclusion, experience from the opposite side, the capacity to comprehend the contradiction which opposition entails, these are not merely descriptive of the human condition; they are constitutive. The I attains to its full potential only when, and only to the extent that, it meets the “other” as a Thou. Argument as a way of “living through a common experience from the other side” as a reciprocal honoring of the “person” rather than a unilateral exploitation of the biological or economic individual, is, therefore, a way of gaining “freedom” and “responsibility;” a way of achieving “personhood” for oneself by bestowing “personhood” upon another. Johnstone has remarked that the creature who refuses to argue or to listen to arguments must, of necessity, remain something less than human. Because [sic] man is by nature a social animal [sic] he attains complete humanity only when [sic] he enters into such relationships as argument provides. The ultimate justification of argument as method, therefore, lies not in any pragmatic test of results achieved or disasters avoided. Rather it lies in the fact that by introducing the arguer “into a situation of risk in which open-mindedness and tolerance are possible,” it paves the way toward “personhood” for the disputants, and through them and millions like them opens the way to a society in which the values and commitments to “personhood” may some day replace the exploitation and strife which now separate [sic] man from [sic] man and nation from nation.

8. TOPICALITY IS A NORM THAT ENCOURAGES PLURALITY AND DIVERSITY OF OPINION IN DEBATE.

Star Muir, 1993 prof. of speech communication @ George Mason University, 1993. (Philosophy & Rhetoric, vol. 26; pg. 290-291).

A final point about relativism is that switch-side debate encourages fairness and equality of opportunity in evaluating competing values. Initially, it is apparent that a priori fairness is a fundamental aspect of games and gamesmanship [sic]. Players in the game should start out with equal advantage, and the rules should be construed throughout to provide no undue advantage to one side or the other. Both sides, notes Thompson, should have an equal amount of time and a fair chance to present their arguments. Of critical importance, he insists, is an equality of opportunity. Equality of opportunity is manifest throughout many debate procedures and norms. On the question of topicality—whether the affirmative plan is an example of the stated topic—the issue of “fair ground” for debate is explicitly developed as a criterion for decision. Likewise, when a counterplan is offered against an affirmative plan, the issue of coexistence, or of the “competitiveness” of the plans, frequently turns on the fairness of the affirmative team’s suggested “permutation” of the plans. In these and other issues, the value of fairness, and of equality of opportunity, is highlighted and clarified through constant disputation. The point is simply that debate does teach values, and that these values are instrumental in providing a hearing for alternative points of view. Paying explicit attention to decision criteria, and to the division of ground arguments (a function of competition), effectively renders the value structure pluralistic rather than relativisitic.

## 9. TESTING POINTS OF VIEW FROM BOTH SIDES IS CRITICAL TO MORAL EDUCATION.

Star Muir, 1993 prof. of speech communication @ George Mason University, 1993(Philosophy & Rhetoric, vol. 26; pg. 291). Sound conviction, a key element of an individual’s moral identity, is thus closely linked to a reasoned assessment of both sides. Some have even suggested that it would be immoral not to require debaters to defend both sides of the issues. It does seem hypocritical to accept the basic premise of debate, that two opposing accounts are present on everything, and then to allow students the comfort of their own untested convictions. Debate might be rendering students a disservice insofar as moral education is concerned, if it did not provide them some knowledge of alternative views and the concomitant strength of a reasoned moral conviction.

# Answers to the Kritik of Topicality

## 10. RULES FOR DISCUSSION ARE NECESSARY FOR BENEFICIAL DECISION-MAKING AND TO AVOID DOMINATION OF OTHERS IN DISCUSSION.

Hugh Duncan, 1993 (Landmark Essays on Kenneth Burke, ed. Barry Brummet; pg. 196-197).

Nothing better illustrates the power of form in social relationships than rules. In play, games, manners, and all moments of pure sociability we are bound to each other by the form of the game. Such forms function as bounds and determinants of conduct. As Mead taught us, in games we play our positions in terms of assumptions about how other players will play theirs. But these assumptions, however internalized, are objectified in forms of play which must be followed if the game is to be played fairly. Once rules are made and codified so that all concerned may know them, we appoint an umpire to serve as guardian of the rules we ourselves have made or accepted. His power is derived from his knowledge of the rules and his ability to apply them quickly and surely in all moments of play. He “speaks from the book (of rules)” and can “throw the book at us,” as we say in America. Like the judge in common law, the umpire must remember that he applies, but does not interpret or create, rules. Reason in democratic society is born in discussion that depends on disputants who remain loyal to the rules of discussion. In a society based on discussion there are no “revealed truths,” any more than there are “laws” (physical, biological, or historical) of social process which “determine” human conduct. Nor, for that matter, are there fixed logical canons of inquiry. What we do try to fix, and make binding on all, are rules for discussion. Opponents not only tolerate but honor and respect each other because in doing so they enhance their own chances of thinking better and reaching sound decisions. Opposition is necessary because it sharpens thought in action. We assume that argument, discussion, and talk, among free and informed people who subordinate themselves to rules of discussion, are the best ways to decisions of any kind, because it is only through such discussion that we reach agreement that binds us to a common cause. We assume also in democracy that the highest kind of human relationship is friendship, because friendship among people of very different ranks and capacities enlarges our understanding and thus strengthens the “will” of our social bonds. If we are to be equal, and if we believe discussions among equals is a way to truth, relationships among equals must find expression in many formal and informal institutions. Equals agree, inferiors obey, superiors command. Democracy lives in agreement and it remains strong so long as there are many ways of reaching agreement.

# \*\*\*\*\*AFF Answers\*\*\*\*\*

# Space Includes Asteroids (2ac)

## 1) Counter-interpretation: space contains asteroids:

Ralph Nansen, (Former Program Manager, Boeing Solar Power Satellite Program), ENERGY CRISIS: SOLUTION FROM SPACE, 2009, 145.

The term "space" may be somewhat misleading because even though it appears to be a great void, it contains many things: the earth, our moon, the other planets, asteroids, the sun, and billions and billions of stars in the heavens.

## 2) Their interpretation overlimits: they limit out cases dealing with asteroids, Mars, other planets, virtually anything in space is limited out by their interpretation.

## 3) They destroy education about space: no value in learning about the black void between objects—education comes from learning about what is in space.

## 4) They destroy the literature base: virtually no literature based AFF’s exist on their interpretation as space as merely a void.

## 5) They make the term development meaningless—no proof you can even develop the black void of space.

## 6) They have sufficient ground—we link to all space based disads like spending, politics, etc.

## 7) Good is good enough: our interpretation is reasonable and prevents a race to the bottom.

A) they limit out cases dealing with Mars, the Sun, other planets, etc—virtually anything valuable in space is limited out by their interpretation

B) they make the term “development” meaningless—no proof you can

# Space Includes Asteroids (Extensions)

## Outer space includes everything beyond the Earth’s atmosphere:

Peter Topychkanov, 2010 (Research Associate, Institute for Asian and African Studies, Moscow State U.), OUTER SPACE: WEAPONS, DIPLOMACY, AND SECURITY, 2010, 3.

Outer space is understood as everything beyond the Earth's atmosphere.

## Space includes everything beyond Earth’s atmosphere:

Erik Gregersen, (Associate Editor, Astronomy & Space Exploration, Brittanica Educational Publishers), UNMANNED SPACE MISSIONS, 2010, 20.

Space, as considered here, is defined as all the reaches of the universe beyond Earth's atmosphere. There is no definitive boundary above Earth at which space begins, but, in terms of the limiting altitude for vehicles designed for atmospheric flight, it may be considered to be as low as 45 km (28 miles). The lowest practical orbit for an artificial satellite around Earth is about 160 km (100 miles).

## Space is the part of the universe outside the Earth’s atmosphere:

Sybil P. Parker, 1994 (Editor), MCGRAW-HILL DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 1994, 178.

Space: Specifically, the part of the universe lying outside the limits of the earth's atmosphere.

## Space includes the other planets and stars of the solar system:

Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2011 (Online, Accessed May 9, 2011 at http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/space)

6. a. the region beyond the earth's atmosphere containing the other planets of the solar system, stars, galaxies, etc; universe b. ( as modifier ): a space probe ; space navigation

# Exploration 2ac Answers

## 1) Counter-interpretation: Exploration includes discovery for scientific reasons:

Fabio Tronchetti, 2009 (Prof., Law, Leiden U., The Netherlands), THE EXPLOITATION OF NATURAL RESOURCES OF THE MOON AND OTHER CELESTIAL BODIES: A PROPOSAL FOR A LEGAL REGIME, 2009, 22.

The term exploration did not generate any particular debate. It refers to discovery activities of the space environment for scientific reasons. The problems arise with regards of the interpretation of the term "use". The "use" of outer space and its resources may refer to such use either for scientific or for commercial purposes.

## 2) We meet the counter-interpretation: We discover where asteroids are for the purpose of deflection.

## 3) Their interpretation overlimits: they limit out any point of exploration if we can’t use the discoveries for pragmatic purposes.

## 4) Our interpretation provides fair ground: we link to topic specific disads like politics and spending.

## 5) Good is good enough: our interpretation is reasonable and prevents a race to the bottom.

# Exploration Means Investigation

## Exploration means investigation, search, or study:

Ulrike Bohlmann, 2009 (Lawyer, European Space Agency), HUMANS IN OUTER SPACE: INTERDISCIPLINARY ODYSSEYS, 2009, 184. In general, the term "exploration" signifies investigation, search, study, or travel for discovery parallel to a geographic expedition. In a narrower sense, the term is understood to mean investigation of the universe beyond the Earth's atmosphere by means of manned and unmanned spacecraft.

## Explore is to search for the purpose of discovery:

Steven Kleinedler, 2005 (Editor), AMERICAN HERITAGE DESK DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS, 2005, 270.

Explore: To search or travel into for the purpose of discovery.

# Mining AFF: Development

## Development means to make usable:

Princteon U. Language Lab, WORDNET, 2011. Retrieved Mar. 3, 2011 from http://www.google.com/search?sclient=psy&hl=en&safe=active&site=&source=hp&q=define%3A+develop&aq=f&aqi=&aql=&oq=&pbx=1 .

Develop: Change the use of and make available or usable.

## Develop means to make usable:

MERRIAM-WEBSTER’S SCHOOL DICTIONARY, 2004, 261.

Develop: To make more available or usable.

## Development can mean to refine a product:

Augustus Stevenson, (Editor), NEW OXFORD AMERICAN DICTIONARY, 3rd Ed., 2010, 476.

Development: A new or refined product or idea.

# Beyond 2ac Front-Line

## 1) Counter-interpretation: Beyond means past:

Steven Kleinedler, 2005 (Editor), AMERICAN HERITAGE DESK DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS, 2005, 74.

Beyond: On the far side of, past.

## 2) The plan meets the counter-interpretation: we only map asteroids beyond the Earth’s mesosphere.

## 3) They mix burdens: their argument is a solvency argument—we might not solve for asteroids that are already below the mesosphere, but it doesn’t mean the plan isn’t topical.

## 4) Good is good enough—our interpretation is reasonable and grounded in the literature—they should be able to debate it.

# Increase Can Mean Create

## Increase can mean increase from zero:

WORDS AND PHRASES, 2007 CUMULATIVE SUPPLEMENTARY PAMPHLET, Vol. 20A, 07, 76. Increase: Salary change of from zero to $12,000 and $1,200 annually for mayor and councilmen respectively was an “increase” in salary and not merely the fixing of salary. King v. Herron, 243 S.E.2d36, 241 Ga. 5.

# Increase 2ac Front-Line

## 1) Counter-interpretation: increase means to increase monetarily:

WORDS AND PHRASES, 2007 CUMULATIVE SUPPLEMENTARY PAMPHLET, Vol. 20A, 07, 76.

Increase: A durational modification of child support is as much an “increase” as a monetary modification. State ex rel. Jarvela v. Burke, 678 N.W.2d 68.

## 2) We meet: we fully fund asteroid mapping—our inherency evidence indicates it is underfunded now.

## 3) Their interpretation overlimits: they prevent cases which provide more funding for programs like Constellation, Mission to Mars, etc.

## 4) Our interpretation provides fair ground: we link to topic specific disads like spending and politics.

## 5) Good is good enough: our interpretation is reasonable and supported in the literature.

# Earth Means the Third Planet From the Sun

## Earth means the third planet from the sun:

Princteon U. Language Lab, WORDNET, 2011. Retrieved Mar. 3, 2011 from <http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?s=earth>.

Earth: The 3rd planet from the sun; the planet we live on.

# Mesosphere Means the Region Beyond the Stratosphere

## The mesosphere is the region beyond the stratosphere.

Joseph Angelo, Jr., 2006 (Editor), ENCYCLOPEDIA OF SPACE AND ASTRONOMY, 2006, 393.

Mesosphere: The region of Earth's atmosphere above the stratosphere that is characterized by temperature decreasing with height. The top of this layer, called the menopause, occurs between 80 and 85 kilometers altitude.

## Mesosphere is above the stratosphere:

FACTS ON FILE DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 2006, 39.

Above the stratopause is the mesosphere, in which the temperature falls with height to reach about -- 90 °C at the mesopause at an altitude of about 85 km.

## Mesosphere is above the stratosphere and below the thermosphere:

Augustus Stevenson, 2010 (Editor), NEW OXFORD AMERICAN DICTIONARY, 3rd Ed., 2010, 1098.

Mesosphere: The region of the earth’s atmosphere above the stratosphere and below the thermosphere, between about 30 and 50 miles in altitude.

## Mesosphere is the middle layer of the Earth’s atmosphere:

Ian Ridpath, 2007 (Editor), A DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 2007, 316.

Mesosphere: The middle layer of Earth's atmosphere, lying above the \*stratosphere and below the \*thermosphere, at altitudes of 50-85 km.

## Mesosphere is part of Earth’s upper atmosphere:

Martin Ince, (Editor), DICTIONARY OF ASTRONOMY, 1997, 107.

Mesosphere: Part of the Earth's upper atmosphere stretching from the top of the stratosphere at about 50km above sea level to the base of the ionosphere at about 90km.

## Mesosphere is about 50 miles above the Earth’s surface:

Steven Kleinedler, 2005 (Editor), AMERICAN HERITAGE DESK DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS, 2005, 471.

Mesosphere: The portion of the atmosphere from about 30 to 80 km. (20 to 50 miles) above the earth’s surface.

# And/or Means Either (2ac Front Line)

## 1) Counter-interpretation: and/or means either:

Justin Crozier, 2005 (Editor), COLLINS DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS, 2005, 27.

And/or: Either one or the other or both.

## 2) We meet the counter-interpretation: we explore space for asteroids.

## 3) They overlimit: they require both exploration and development—few topical cases do both.

## 4) Framers’ Intent: if topic had meant both, they would have said AND and not and/or

## 5) Good is good enough: we are reasonable and provide fair ground.

# Substantially Counter-interpretations

## Substantially means to a large degree:

Carol-June Cassidy, 2008 (Editor), CAMBRIDGE DICTIONARY OF AMERICAN ENGLISH, 2nd Ed., 08, 873.

Substantially: To a large degree.

## Substantially means not imaginary:

Michael Agnes, 2006 (Editor-In-Chief), WEBSTER’S NEW WORLD COLLEGE DICTIONARY, 4TH EDITION, 06, 1428. (Cleveland, OH: Wiley) Substantial: real; actual; true; not imaginary.

## Substantially means considerable:

THE AMERICAN HERITAGE DICTIONARY OF THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE, 4th Edition, 2006, 1727.

Substantial: Considerable in importance, value, degree, amount, or extent: won by a substantial margin.

## Substantially means to a great or significant extent:

Christine Lindberg, 2007 (Managing Editor), OXFORD COLLEGE DICTIONARY, 2nd Ed., 07, 1369. (NY: Sparks Publishing)

Substantially: to a great or significant extent.